



NEW JERSEY MEDICAL SCHOOL

Division of Radiation Research
Department of Radiology
Phone: (973) 972-5323/5067
Fax: (973) 972-6474
E-mail: raodv@umdnj.edu
rhowell@umdnj.edu

MSB F-451
185 South Orange Avenue
University Heights
Newark, NJ 07103-2714

MEMORANDUM

Friday
Date: April 6, 2001
To: Stephen Baker, MD
Professor and Chairman of Radiology
From: Roger W. Howell, Ph.D. *RWA*
Associate Professor of Radiology
Re: Integrity of data

This memo is to follow up on our discussion this morning regarding Dr. Hill's accusations of falsification of data by my Research Associate, Anupam Bishayee, PhD. As I mentioned to you, I first became aware of Dr. Hill's concerns about six to nine months ago when she brought this to my attention. Having worked closely with Anupam on experimental design and analysis of the data, and after further reviewing his data, I told her at that time that I did not believe that there was any problem with the data and I did not take any further action at that time. This past Wednesday April 4, 2001, I was informed by a member of another department in NJMS that Dr. Hill had recently spoken to a few persons regarding her suspicions. Knowing that I already had a meeting scheduled with you for today, April 6, 2001, I decided to ponder the situation for a day or two and discuss it with you at that time. As I told you this morning, I have requested that my post-doctoral fellow Marek Lenarczyk, PhD repeat some of Dr. Bishayee's experiments as a check of the validity of the data. Dr. Bishayee will work closely with Dr. Lenarczyk to ensure that the experiments are performed in an identical manner. I will also personally sign all of Dr. Bishayee's data sheets and culture dishes to ensure that they are not tampered with. I believe that these steps will be sufficient to document the validity of Dr. Bishayee's data. Dr. Bishayee has been a faithful and hard-worker and I fully believe that his results will be reproducible.

There are a number of factors that support my confidence that Dr. Bishayee's data is indeed valid. First and foremost was that Dr. Bishayee's original findings which led to the observation of "bystander effects" in our experimental model were serendipitous. About three

years ago when Dr. Bishayee first joined my laboratory, I had planned to use tritiated thymidine as a control so that a pelleted population of cells consisting of heavily radiolabeled and unlabeled cells in a 1:1 ratio would ultimately lead to the death of all of the radiolabeled cells and none of the unlabeled cells. Thus, I fully anticipated a surviving fraction of 50%. However, Dr. Bishayee found that a large fraction of the unlabeled cells unexpectedly died. Initially I was upset with Dr. Bishayee because I believed that some mistake had been made in the experiments. However, I had Dr. Bishayee repeat this study at least three times and the same phenomenon was observed. Ultimately I attributed this phenomenon to bystander effects and we have subsequently shown that the signaling responsible for the death of the unlabeled bystander cells is mediated through gap junctions. Another factor in my confidence is that the mathematical gymnastics required to analyze the data are not trivial and it would be difficult to manipulate them without my knowledge. These are strong arguments that I discussed with Dr. Hill when she first raised her concerns several months ago. However, despite them, her suspicions have persisted and have led to this situation. I will take all steps necessary to prove that the data is valid beginning with those that I have outlined at the end of the first paragraph.